Chapter 14
Final Considerations

BRIT ÅGOT BRØSKE DANIELSEN & GEIR JOHANSEN

In this last chapter we will discuss some of our considerations about how the results of our single studies connect to the overarching research question:

> How can student music teachers' learning, and the relevance of music teacher education, be described within the relations between the institution, the practicum and the professional arena, and all in the frames of a multicultural society?

By looking back at the chapters of this anthology, along with drawing on other insights that were developed within the single studies of the MUPP project, we will relate our considerations to some implications and challenges for future music teacher education that have emerged in the project. We found that these implications and challenges confront music teacher education with problems of how best to: *relate to the society*; *select content*; *enhance learning and competence development*; *promote identity formation*; *conceive music teaching as a profession;* and *identify needs for future studies.*

Relating to the Society

Among the characteristics of a contemporary, multicultural society are the multiple ways in which people learn and relate to music. This multiplicity of musical relations and cultures presupposes and entails music teaching as an expanding and differentiated vocational field. Correspondingly, the education of music teachers must increase its many-sidedness, and its ability

to prepare student teachers for a future wherein continuous competence adjustments, including increased knowledge and experience with multicultural contexts, are necessary.

The challenges that are raised in these ways must be handled within existing political frameworks, since the structures within which music teacher education operates and finds room for action are constructed by the authorities who prioritise and carry out educational politics. We hold that music teacher educators should make efforts to utilize the possibilities of existing frameworks in order to make for the best education possible, along with simultaneously criticizing those frames constructively with the aim to enact improvements and changes. Such critical-constructive endeavours are also necessary to being capable of adapting to future societal and cultural, as well as political changes. By maintaining a balance between social maintenance and criticism, music teacher educators contribute to the continuous and vital dynamics of society, as well as to education itself, along with contributing to qualify student teachers in critical-constructive thinking. Closely linked with this are music teacher educators' and music teachers' ways of conceiving their general obligation to act as responsible, constructively critical citizens who participate in society by making the best of the present conditions whilst always aiming for something better.

Selecting the Content

Turning now from societal perspectives to the inside of music teacher education, the content of this education can be construed in various ways on the institutional as well as the subject/course level. At both these levels the content can be organised variously, entailing different learning experiences and outcomes for student music teachers.

On the institutional level educational content can be thought to include the body of subjects and courses that student teachers are expected to follow, as described in the relevant, formal curricula. At this level the selection of content is related to the organisational choices that institutions make. Our findings herein have suggested that such decisions must be deliberate but still flexible. The selection of content should aim to arrive at a meaningful collection of subject matter as well as enhancing fruitful connections *between* the various courses and the practicum. Such connections have been made in the MUPP project with respect to promoting deep learning.

Significant insights about the institutional organization of *the practicum* have been introduced by questioning the views and notions of 'practice'. Firstly, the common notion that student teachers are best organised in small groups in the practicum, which is manifested in the formal curriculum[1], had to be discussed. The student teachers' learning would profit from varying the group size according to the learning aims and the question about the student teachers' progress of their studies. In addition, the context and location of a particular practicum period would have to be considered, for it is clear that teaching in a primary school in Norway is very different from teaching in a Palestinian refugee camp in Lebanon. By participating in groups of various sizes, student teachers acquire ideas about how to organise their future professional activities. Secondly, rather than trying to represent the breadth and complexity of the labour market, it has seemed most effective to select arenas that would enable significant experiences in student teachers. This contributes to reach practicum goals, such as significant learning experiences and professional development, as well as increasing student teachers' motivation for the music teacher vocation. The concept '*high-leverage practices*' (Lampert, 2010; Brøske Danielsen, this volume) could fruitfully be redefined from describing practices with significance for, say, how primary school children learn, to designate the degree of the practicum's impact on student music teachers' professional development. Possibilities for sharing experiences between student music teachers and their practicum supervisors have been reported to have a significant effect on achieving this. Furthermore, the practicum needs to be perceived by student music teachers, as well as their lecturers and professors, as an educational subject in line with the rest of the courses at the institution. Hence, the structure of the practicum should be described like any other course with respect to clear goals, the components of its content, and the directions of assessment.

The *Musikdidaktik* courses that the student music teachers attended were expected to provide a hub for music teacher education as a whole, because all the knowledge and experience of music teacher education meets in such courses. This opens up the possibility for *Musikdidaktik* courses to maintain a mediating function between the remote practicum and the rest of the courses at the institution, thereby constituting the ground for student teachers' reflections on moving from earlier, norma-

---

1 Curriculum plan for Bachelor's degree programme in music teacher education, NAM http://nmh.studiehandbok.no/nmh/Studiehaandboeker/Studiehaandbok-2011–12/Studier/Bachelornivaastudier/KAMP-Kandidatstudiet-i-musikkpedagogikk

tive teaching principles to a descriptive-analytic, research and reflection model in their practicum .

On the course/subject level the content can be seen as the content *of* those courses, including such issues as multiculturalism, the legitimation of music education, and the Orff 'method'. At this level, the selection of content was seen to be important to student music teachers' identity and their deep versus surface learning. Although parts of the content seemed irrelevant to the future professional role and the identities that the student teachers envisaged for themselves, the risk of surface learning increased. In order to widen the scope and usefulness of these courses, it seemed necessary to be mindful of student music teachers' notions of their future, professional identities. A vital factor in this respect was the degree to which student teachers' musical skills provided a basis for broadening their educational scope, thereby bringing questions about the priorities of educational and musical competence to the fore.

Balancing *music* and *education* has been considered vital to the selection and organisation of the content of music teacher education across the various subjects and practicum fields. In Chapter 2 we related that balance to Klafki's (Nielsen, 2002) concept of 'field of relation' which holds that neither educational nor musical criteria are sufficient for the selection of content. Rather, sufficient criteria have to be developed "in the border area, or rather in the field of relations between [them]" (ibid., p. 109). Such balances are illustrated by insights into how the lack of a common language between student music teachers and Palestinian children highlights the ways in which music has contributed to teaching strategies and decisions in the Lebanese practicum (Brøske Danielsen, accepted). With respect to the concept of holistic quality learning was looked into (Ferm Thorgersen, Chapter 10 of this volume), the student teachers reported that knowledge in, of and about music enhanced their deep learning in the *Musikdidaktik* courses wherein the philosophy of music and the philosophy of teaching were tightly intertwined, thereby constituting together a basis for teaching music and for learning *Musikdidaktik*. In these instances *Musikdidaktik* learning offered opportunities for meetings between the artist and the teacher, which runs parallel with the teacher-performer balance that was empirically illustrated in the OASE study (Kalsnes, this volume).

> The multiple ways in which people learn and relate to music, as well as to their multicultural societies, entails the recognition of music teaching as an ever-expanding and differentiated vocational field that reflects the ma-

ny-sidedness of music teacher education today. In so doing music teacher education realises the ideals of 'exemplarity' (Illeris, 1977; Klafki, 1983) as a principle for selecting content. The exemplarity principle confronts the problem of vast complexity with the idea of systematically selecting content according to a series of specific criteria, among which 'transfer value' is one. Hence, it will be necessary to connect the question of content selection to considerations of what would be the most suitable teaching strategies, the best locations in which to practice teaching, and the best ways to connect these contents, strategies and locations.

Enhancing Learning and Competence Development

When addressing questions of student music teachers' learning, the need to attend to *relations* emerged as a common trait and a paramount principle across the single studies. Focusing thus on relations has afforded a promising perspective on the relations between education and future profession, between the various institution-based courses, between those courses and the practicum, as well as between the metaphors of participation and knowledge acquisition.

One of the most central aims of student teachers' learning has been considered to be how to prepare for the future profession, and how best to effect lifelong learning, both of which demand readiness for change (Graabræk Nielsen & Westby, this volume). To an increasing extent music teachers have to compose and design their own professional positions in terms of combinations of, for example, general, instrumental, ensemble, and community music teaching. Such combinations, and hence selections, presuppose continuous analyses of the musical field and its developments, such as music in the social media and internet communities. Paraphrasing Renshaw (2003), we envisage a portfolio music teacher who demonstrates the characteristics and learning abilities of a 'competency nomad' (Krejsler, 2007; Graabræk Nielsen & Westby, this volume): a service-minded professional who engages in the acquisition of new knowledge when facing new challenges over his or her whole professional life span.

To develop expert competency in teaching music, whilst assembling professional portfolios and cultivating the characteristics of a competency nomad, student music teachers' learning must be conceived as a relational feature influenced by socio-cultural as well as individual factors. Further-

more, we suggest that the forces influencing the effectiveness and direction of learning are closely connected to student music teachers' feelings of authenticity and meaningfulness in the courses they attend along with the ways that these priorities are subject to communication and reflection by means of processes that also include emotional dimensions (Ferm Thorgersen, chapter 10, this volume).

The notion of 'socio-cultural learning' was well-adapted to the student teachers' learning through their participation in communities of practice, wherein and between which their learning followed given trajectories. Thus music teacher education has great potential for improving the learning of its student teachers by attending more explicitly to their learning trajectories between the practicum and the courses at the institution, and in relation to the development of their future identities as professional music teachers. In order to attend explicitly to these trajectories it was thought necessary to study the factors influencing them at the level of the organization, the professors and supervisors; and the student music teachers themselves. In addition to attending to the conditions of learning trajectories, other issues that may influence their directions were brought to the fore. For example, we raised the question of whether negotiations of meaning in classroom management effect student teachers' competence as teachers (Ferm Thorgersen & Johansen, this volume); and whether negotiating choices of music to teach focuses their attention on lesson planning (ibid.), since such choices rest on philosophical considerations about music and education. It is worthy of remark that the role of music in structuring the development of student teachers' competence runs parallel to the above discussion about how it structures the content of music teacher education.

From a socio-cultural perspective, the learning processes of student music teachers were also connected to epistemic (Lahn & Jensen, 2008), intellectual and physical (Säljö, 2005) tools, such as repertoire and musical instruments. It is not difficult to see how, for example, musical instruments such as violin, electric guitar or Orff xylophone, carry different cultural traditions of teaching and learning music, not to mention the possibilities and restrictions of a computer.

The notion of 'learning systems' (Wenger, 2006) implies that learning goes on between communities of practice as well as within them, counter, to some extent, the idea that learning processes are linked very strongly to the specific context of the community of practice. Consequently it must be questioned how knowledge acquired in this specific context is relevant to other contexts of professional life (Graabræk Nielsen & Westby, this volume). Nevertheless, inspired by Sfard (1998), we found it fruitful to in-

clude the acquisition metaphor in our view of student teachers' learning. Hence, we subscribe to the idea that "[…] if a model of learning is to be convincing, it is probably bound to build on the notion of an acquired, situational invariant property of the learner, which goes together with him or her from one situation to another" (ibid., 10), and also to the idea that our ability to prepare today to meet tomorrow's questions and challenges is among the most central aspects of learning.

Conceiving of student music teachers' learning by drawing on the metaphors of participation, tools and acquisition, as well as between Bernstein's ideas of practical and theoretical syntheses (Graabræk Nielsen & Westby, this volume), raises one further question of how best to promote deep learning with respect to a fruitful blend of expertise, readiness for future change, and lifelong learning in music teacher education.

We suggest focusing on synergies in order to find a possible answer to this question based on the findings of the present project. This particularly concerns the synergies afforded by relating the learning within separate courses in the institution of music teacher education to the learning in the remote practicum. Furthermore, we hold that bringing these synergies into contact with the traits and dynamics of the larger society and culture, within which the relevant learning arenas take part, may constitute a fruitful ground for student teachers' learning in, for instance, the classroom management course, performance lessons, pre-service training of the OASE project, and in the refugee camp in the Lebanon.

Promoting Identity Formation

Identity and identity formation have attracted interest across several of the single studies as well as chapters in the present collection. They have been connected to music teacher identity and professional identity, along with the concept of a professional music teacher. From a lifelong learning perspective, identity issues have been related to student music teachers and music teacher graduates, as well as to professional music teachers.

Hence, identity formation plays a vital role within student teachers' learning (Johansen, 2008; 2010) as a central component of their professional development. When reflecting on the single studies it becomes evident that these matters have been demonstrated empirically as well as theoretically, by drawing on a 'life-world' phenomenological perspective supported by the sociological perspectives of late modernity and the 'post signifying' society.

These theoretical perspectives, when thought of together, illustrate our empirical findings that various notions and experiences of identity – from identity as a permanent core, to identity as performative and dynamic – exist side by side in student music teachers' minds. Some of the student teachers understood themselves as having a core identity (Hall, 1992) through which all tasks and learning challenges are channelled, whilst others felt that changing identity from one subject to another enhanced their learning. It was also evident that the student teachers' actual movements back and forth between the arenas of the institution and the various practicum fields caused their self concepts to be repeatedly inspected and adjusted, which illustrates how identity formation is a continuous, reflexive project (Giddens, 1990; 1991).

The multitude of identity formation challenges among student music teachers has been illustrated in discussions of the roles of the professional music teacher, such as a community music activity leader, or between their identities as a (music) teacher and a musician (Bouij, 1998; Dolloff, 2006). Student music teachers seem to have experienced changes between various, parallel identities when handling such challenges (Johansen, 2008).

The ability to handle parallel identities appears to be a central challenge for music teachers, in connection with the multiple and ever-expanding ways in which people relate to music, thereby bringing to mind the idea of future professional music teachers as 'competency nomads'. In order to strengthen this capability we suggest that identity work among student music teachers should be explicitly and systematically addressed within their education to a greater extent than hitherto. We also hold that the identity focus might be fruitfully connected with the question raised in the content section above about selecting practicum arenas that provide significant experiences for student music teachers, rather than looking for a representative breadth of, say, children's ages or the variety of schools.

Conceiving Music Teaching as a Profession

Separating the concepts of 'a profession', 'being a professional' and the ideal of 'professionalism' has enabled a discussion of their inter-connections as well as the characteristics of professional education (as discussed in Chapter 2, this volume).

The theory and scholarship on professions often directs interest inwards towards questions concerning the characteristics of knowledge and competence, and outwards to ideals of service mindedness (Krejsler, 2007)

and contributions to the stability of society (Fauske, 2008). When regarding the education of music teachers as professional education, we found it interesting to balance the social adaptation and maintenance perspectives by drawing on descriptions that position the professions as a separate community sector between a centralized bureaucracy and the free market (ibid.), along with the often connected tensions and conflicts between professional autonomy and governmental steering (ibid.).

Within such a critical perspective, the professional music teachers' double obligations of contributing to social stability as well as to change and future development, have been brought to the fore. For the music teacher educators these double obligations have involved the challenge to make the best out of existing political frames whilst still criticising those frames in order to contribute constructively to future social change.

When seen as 'competence nomads', music teachers' as well as music teacher educators' critical potential can be described in terms of a "nomadic state" (Gould, 2005), and with reference to Braidotti's (ibid., p. 153) description of 'critical consciousness' as "a critical positioning towards the prevailing regime: a critical consciousness that resists settling into socially coded modes of thought and behavior…the subversion of set conventions […]" (ibid.).

Identifying Needs of Future Studies

The studies of music teacher education by seven separate, sub studies that have thrown light on a common, overarching research question, have entailed a series of emerging ideas and the need for further studies. These would build partly on, and deepen, the insights that have been developed in the present project. In addition they would complement the MUPP studies by directing attention towards other areas.

Within the area of profession theory we need studies about how music teachers, student music teachers and music teacher educators perceive of music teaching as a profession, along with the concepts of professional, professionalism and professional development. Hopefully this would lay the ground for subsequent questionnaire surveys built on more commonly understood concepts than hitherto.

It has become clear that we lack studies of most sides of the music teacher practicum. For instance, questions of how student teachers and practicum supervisors think of the structure of the practicum as an educational course, including their reflections on subject goals, and the selection

of content and teaching strategies, would be useful. Looking into such issues could also contribute to insights into how the practicum is conceived and acted out by student teachers and supervisors, as well as how it contributes to their deep learning and professional motivation.

Our studies of student music teachers' learning were based mainly on qualitative research interviews with student teachers and their lecturers and professors. In order to deepen the resultant insights, and to test hypotheses that can be formulated on that basis, we call for longitudinal studies of student teachers' learning trajectories. Such studies could inform us significantly about how student teachers handle learning transfer between courses at the institution, and between these courses and the practicum, as well as in the vocational field. In addition, questionnaire surveys addressing larger populations of student music teachers could bring valuable further insights.

The term 'competence nomad' should be studied, both theoretically as well as empirically, in order to ground discussions about how best to educate music teachers for an unknown future. In theory, the notion of the music teacher as a competence nomad would profit from being related to the theory of Deleuze and Guattari (1988) in which it is anchored, and to the feminist literature that draws on its critical potential (Gould, 2005; Braidotti, 1994).

Across these various research approaches and issues, music teacher education needs to collect systematic knowledge about, in particular, two fields. The first of these is the increasing body of research on music education and multiculturalism. If adapted as a certain perspective in studies like the ones sketched above, this body of research would probably have implications for the aims, the selection of content, and the working methods of music educators. The other field concerns research and development work which concentrates particularly on the formal-informal nexus of music education. When considered together, multicultural and formal-informal perspectives might result in new connections between theory and practice that reflect their interdependence, and which can lead to the education of professional music teachers to become capable citizens in an ever-changing future.

References

Bouij, C. (1998). Swedish music teachers in training and professional life. *International Journal of Music Education*, *32*, 24–31.

Braidotti, R. (1994). *Nomadic Subjects. Embodiment and Sexual Difference in Contemporary Feminist Theory*. New York: Columbia University Press.

Brøske Danielsen, B. Å. (accepted). Community music activity in a refugee camp – student music teachers' practicum experiences. *Music Education Research*.

Deleuze, G., & Guattari, F. (1988). *A Thousand Plateaus: Capitalism and Schizophrenia*. London: The Athlone Press.

Dolloff, L. A. (2006). Celebrating and Nurturing the Identity of the Musician/Teacher. In B. Stålhammar (Ed.), *Music and Human Beings – Music and Identity* (pp. 123–136). Örebro: Universitetsbiblioteket.

Fauske, H. (2008). Profesjonsforskningens faser og stridsspørsmål. [The Phases and Issues of the Research on Professions]. In A. Molander & L. I. Terum (Eds .), *Profesjonsstudier* [The Study of Professions]. (pp. 29–53). Oslo: Universitetsforlaget.

Giddens, A. (1990). *The Consequences of Modernity*. Stanford: Stanford University Press.

Giddens, A. (1991). *Modernity and Self-Identity*. Stanford: Stanford University Press.

Gould, E. (2005). Nomadic Turns. Epistemology, Experience, And Women University Band Directors. *Philosophy Of Music Education Review, 13* (2), 147–164.

Hall, S. (1992). The Question of Cultural Identity. In S. Hall, D. Held & T. McGrew (Eds.). *Modernity and its Futures* (pp. 273–326). Cambridge: Polity Press in association with The Open University.

Illeris, K. (1977). Principper for pædagogisk praksis [Principles of pedagogical practice]. In F. Nielsen (Ed.). Pædagogisk Teori og Praksis [Educational Theory and Practice] (pp. 205–235). Copenhagen: Borgen.

Johansen, G. (2008). Relations between Educational Quality in Music Teacher Education and Students' Perceptions of Identity. In F. V. Nielsen, S. G. Nielsen & S. E. Holgersen (Eds.). *Nordic Research in Music Education. Yearbook vol. 10* (pp. 53–72). Oslo: Norwegian Academy of Music.

Johansen, G. (2010) Modernity, identity and Musical Learning. In Wright, R. (Ed.), Sociology and Music Education (p. 155–164). Farnham: Ashgate.

Klafki, W. (1983). *Kategorial dannelse og kritisk konstruktiv pedagogikk*. Utvalgte artikler ved Sven Erik Nordenbo [Categorial *Bildung* and Critical-Constructive education. Selected articles by Sven Erik Nordenbo] Copenhagen: Nyt Nordisk Forlag Arnold Busck.

Krejsler, J. (2007). Learning, competency nomads, and post-signifying regimes. On teachers and school in the transition from 'industrial' to 'knowledge' society. In N. Kryger (ed.), *Learning beyond cognition* (pp. 37–56). Copenhagen: DPU forlag.

Lahn, L. C. & Jensen, K. (2008). Profesjon og læring. [Profession and Learning]. In A. Molander & L. I. Terum (Eds.), *Profesjonsstudier.* [The Study of Professions]. (pp.295–305). Oslo: Universitetsforlaget.

Lampert, M. (2010). Learning Teaching in, From, and for Practice: What Do We Mean? *Journal of Teacher Education*, 61 (1–2), 21–34.

Nielsen, F. V. (2002). The Didactology of Music as a Field of Theory and Research. In H. E. Fiske (Ed.), *Research Alliance of Institutions for Music Education, Proceedings of the Sixth International*

Symposium. London, Ontario: University of Western Ontario, 101–114.

Renshaw, P. (2003). Connecting Conversations: the Changing Voice of the Artist. Paper at the *European League of Institutes of the Arts Teachers' Academy*, Institut del Teatre and Escola Massana, Barcelona.

Sfard, A. (1998). On Two Metaphors for Learning and the Dangers of Coosing Just One. *Educational Researcher*, 27 (2), 4–13.

Säljö, R. (2005). *Lärande och kulturella redskap*. [Learning and Cultural Tools]. Stockholm: Norstedts.

Wenger, E. (2006). *Learning for a Small Planet. A Research Agenda*. Retrieved from http://www.ewenger.com /research/index.htm.